

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

- 1 Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure as per rule 36(b)
- 3 Title of Procurement: Supply of Bell Washers = 232,650 Nos for CSF/Khanewal.
- 4 Tender Inquiry No: CSF/1016/P/2023
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS524446E
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: 24.11.2023 at 11:00 Hours
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: 24-11-2023 at 11:30 Hours
- 8 No of Bids Received: Four
- 9 Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

Name of Bidder	Technical Marks Obtained	Rule/Regulation/ SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004
M/s. Farooq Enterprises (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore	85	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s ASR Enterprises, Lahore.	-	Technically Un-suitable/ Not qualified
M/s. Decent Builders Lahore.	95	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Continental Engineering Services (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.	82.75	The bid found responsive and technically qualified


(Mateen Ahmed Khan)
Executive Engineer/CSF/HQ
for Managing Director/CSF,
Ph # 042-99201737.

ANNEXURE-"A"**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

2. Weightage/Marks

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

- | | |
|--|----|
| i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory) | |
| ii. Experience of manufacturing / supplying of | 35 |
| Steel / raw material | |
| iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection | |
| / Testing Facility of the manufacturer | 10 |
| iv. Manufacturing Capacity | 25 |
| v. Financial Soundness | 30 |

Total 100 Marks

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% marks and fulfilling the basic / mandatory requirements to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

3. (i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory)

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company or Registration of FBR as supplier etc.
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List **(documentary proof must be submitted along with bid)**.
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender.
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed.
- e) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate. If the firm is already working in CSF/Directorate.
- f) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (Clause-18).
- g) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission.
- h) In case of new participant who has not already supplied Hex Slit Nuts to CSF, 100 Nos quality samples of the same duly engraved manufacture's name free of any cost to be submitted with technical bid for evaluation. The performance of quality samples will be got tested at CSF/ Khanewal.

Contd.....

Bidder



ANNEXURE-"A/1"

- h) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect, as per required standard material (steel) and material must be of following specifications (Table-1 & 2):

TABLE-1 SPECIFICATION

LIMIT VALUES OF CHEMICAL COMPOSITION			
RULING ELEMENTS		% BY WEIGHT	
		Minimum	Maximum
Carbon	C	-	0.08

TABLE-2 DIMENSIONS AND PROPERTIES

		Minimum Value	Maximum Value
Tensile strength	N/mm ²	270 N/mm ² "OR"	350 N/mm ² "OR"
	"OR" Kg/mm ²	27.5 Kg/mm ²	35.5 Kg/mm ²
Yield Value	N/mm ² "OR"	-	220 N/mm ² "OR"
	Kg/mm ²	-	22.5 Kg/mm ²
Elongation	%	36%	-

- i) Manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Bell Washers, at least 3500 Nos per day (**Attach certificate on letter head or contained in brochure / profile of the manufacturer**).
- j) Bidder provide the bank statement for the last month / 30 days (before date of opening of tender) **i.e. from 24.10.2023 to 23.10.2023** of Firm's account showing available balance of at least **Rs.2.00 million** in company's account on any day during said last 30 days.

Note: Any major deviation would render the bid likely to be rejected. Bidder must keep in mind while submitting their bid to avoid major deviations which may include:

- i) Bid Security according to BDS Clause-18 being not enclosed with Technical Bid.
 - ii) Conditional bid being offered e.g. to stipulate condition of advance payment or other conditions.
 - iii) Specifications have not been signed / confirmed.
 - iv) Delivery Period has not been accepted / confirmed.
- (ii) Experience of manufacturing / supplying of Bell Washers / similar steel items (Max Marks = 35)

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer / supplier shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The Bidder has experience of manufacturing / supplying Bell Washers / Similar steel items to various organizations / customers / countries.	35
	a) More than or equal to 5 years. 100%	
	b) Less than 5 years but more than or equal to 4 years. 80%	
	c) Less than 4 years but more than or equal to 2 years. 65%	
	d) Less than 2 years. 0%	
	e) In case of new participant who has submitted the quality samples and declared technically suitable by WM/CSI/KWL their marks will be equal to item-c 65%	

Note: Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter / purchase orders be enclosed

Contd.....

Bidder



(iii) Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility (Max Marks = 10)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material.	5
2	The manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities.	5

Note: The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure.

4. (iv) Manufacturing / supplying capacity of the bidder (Max Marks = 25)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Bidder has the manufacturing / supplying capacity of desired / similar steel items Greater than or equal to 500,000 Nos per year = 25 Marks. Less than 500,000 Nos but more than or equal to 400,000 Nos per year = 20 Marks. Less than 400,000 Nos but more than or equal to 300,000 Nos per year = 15 Marks. Less than 300,000 Nos but more than or equal to 200,000 Nos per year = 10 Marks. Less than 200,000 Nos but more than or equal to 100,000 Nos per year = 05 Marks. Less than 100,000 Nos per year = 0 Marks.	25

Note: Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter be enclosed for evidence.

5. (iv) Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 30)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years: Greater than or equal to 10 Million = 30 Marks Less than 10 Million, but more than or equal to 08 Million = 20 Marks Less than 08 Million, but more than or equal to 06 Million = 10 Marks Less than 06 Million, but more than or equal to 04 Million = 05 Marks. Less than 04 Million = 0 Marks	30

Note: - Annual Audit reports / Bank Statement or annual sales tax / income tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

Note Similar steel item means Bell Washers, Fish Plate, M.S Anchorage Plate etc;

Total = 100 Marks.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70

Bidder



**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BID AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO. CSF/1016/P/2023 OPENED ON 24.11.2023 FOR
PROCUREMENT OF BELL WASHERS DULY GALVANIZED = 232,650 NOS FOR CSF/KHANEWAL.**

PARTICULARS / REQUIREMENTS (AS PER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA, PLACED AT S.NO.3/131 to 3/133)	M/s Farooq Enterprises (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore .	M/s. ASR Enterprises, Lahore	M/s. Decent Builders, Lahore	M/s Cont Engg; Se (Pvt) Ltd, K
	Provided or not provided	Provided or not provided	Provided or not provided	Provided provi
(i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY)				
a Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer/Sole proprietor/partnership deed/ Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company OR registration of FBR as supplier etc?	Provided (As flagged-1 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-12 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-20 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged technical
b Proof of registration with Sales Tax, Income Tax Departments and active on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List?	Provided (As flagged-2 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-13 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-21 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged technical
c Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender?	Provided (As flagged-3 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-14 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-22 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged technical
d Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed?	Provided (As flagged-4 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-15 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-22 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged technical
e Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate, if the firm is already working in CSF?	Provided (As flagged-5 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-16 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-22 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged technical
f Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (clause-18)?	Provided (As flagged-6 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-17 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-23 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged technical
g Has the bidder allowed that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities by signing on all pages of bidding documents?	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	Yes by sign pages of b documen
h Has the bidder provided 100 Nos. quality samples of Bell Washer duly galvanized manufacture's name free of any cost with technical bid for evaluation, in case of new participant who has not already supplied Bell Washer to CSF. The performance of quality samples will be got tested at CSF/Khanewal.	Not Provided as the bidder has already supplied the Bell Washers to CSF	Sample not provided	Not Provided as the bidder has already supplied the Bell Washers to CSF	Provided performan quality sam has been tes CSF/KWL declare technically w vide report as S.No.
i Has the bidder certified on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect, as per required standard material (steel) and material must be of specifications mentioned in criteria for evaluation (Table-1 & 2) on page No.132 of	Provided (As flagged- 7 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-18 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-24 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged technical

Bidding documents?

j) Has the bidder provided proof / certificate on letter head or brochure / profile of the manufacturer showing that manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Bell Washers, at least 3500 Nos per day?	Certificate Provided on letter head (As flagged-7 in technical bid)	Not provided	Provided (As flagged-25 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-37 in technical bid)
k) Has the bidder provided the bank statement for the last month / 30 days (before date of opening of tender) i.e. 24.10.2023 to 23.11.2023 of firm's account showing available balance of at least Rs.2.00 million in company's account on any day during said last 30 days?	Provided (As flagged-8 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-19 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-26 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-38 in technical bid)
All the Mandatory requirements fulfilled or not?	Fulfilled	Not Fulfilled	Fulfilled	Fulfilled

Particulars / Requirements	Total Marks	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained
----------------------------	-------------	--------------------------	----------------	--------------------------	----------------	--------------------------	----------------	--------------------------	----------------

(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING / SUPPLYING OF BELL WASHERS/SIMILAR STEEL ITEMS (MAX: MARKS = 35)

<p>1 Has the bidder provided brochure or profile or letter or purchase orders showing that the bidder has experience of manufacturing / supplying Bell Washers / Similar steel items to various organizations / customers / countries?</p> <p>a) More than or equal to 5 years. 100%</p> <p>b) Less than 5 years, but more than or equal to 4 years. 80%</p> <p>c) Less than 4 years, but more than or equal to 2 years. 65%</p> <p>d) Less than 2 years. 0%</p> <p>e) In case of new participant who has submitted the quality samples and declared technically suitable by WM/CSF/KWL, their marks will be equal to item-c i.e. 65%</p>	35	List of purchase orders of CSF Provided (As flagged-9 in technical bid)	35 (More than 5 years)	-	-	List of purchase orders of CSF Provided (As flagged-27 in technical bid)	35 (More than 5 years)	Provided copies of CSF's purchase orders of similar item (As flagged-39 in technical bid)	22.75 (More than 5 years)
---	----	--	---------------------------	---	---	---	---------------------------	--	------------------------------

(iii) MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENTS & INSPECTION / TESTING FACILITY (MAX: MARKS = 10)

1 Has the bidder provided list or information or brochure of the company / manufacturer that the manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material?	5	List Provided (As flagged-10 in technical bid)	5	-	-	List Provided (As flagged-28 in technical bid)	5	List Provided (As flagged-40 in technical bid)	5
2 Has the bidder provided list or information or brochure of the company / manufacturer showing that the manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities?	5	Not provided	0	-	-	Not provided	0	Not provided	0

(v) MANUFACTURING / SUPPLYING CAPACITY OF THE BIDDER (MAX: MARKS = 25)

Has the bidder provided brochure or profile or letter showing that the bidder has manufacturing / supplying capacity of desired / Similar steel items? 25

Greater than or equal to 500,000 Nos per year = 25 Marks.
 Less than 500,000 Nos but more than or equal to 400,000 Nos per year = 20 Marks.
 Less than 400,000 Nos but more than or equal to 300,000 Nos per year = 15 Marks.
 Less than 300,000 Nos but more than or equal to 200,000 Nos per year = 10 Marks.
 Less than 200,000 Nos but more than or equal to 100,000 Nos per year = 05 Marks.
 Less than 100,000 Nos per year = 0 Marks.

Letter Provided (As flagged-7 in technical bid) 25 (More than 300,000 Nos per year / 10,000 Nos per day)

Letter Provided (As flagged-25 in technical bid) 25 (More than 500,000 Nos per year / 6,000 Nos per day) Provided (As flagged-37 in technical bid) 25 (More than 500,000 Nos per year)

(v) FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF THE BIDDER (MAX: MARKS = 30)

1. Has the bidder provided annual audit reports / bank statement or annual sales tax / income tax returns for the last 3 years showing the average annual turnover? 30

Greater than or equal to 10 Million = 30 Marks.
 Less than 10, but more than or equal to 08 Million = 20 Marks.
 Less than 08, but more than or equal to 06 Million = 10 Marks.
 Less than 06, but more than or equal to 04 Million = 05 Marks.
 Less than 04 Million = 0 Marks.

Annual audit reports Provided (As flagged-11 in technical bid) 20 (More than 8 million)

Provided (As flagged-29 in technical bid) 30 (More than 10 million) Provided (As flagged-41 in technical bid) 30 (More than 1 million)

Total 100 - 85 - - 95 - 82.75

(Total Qualifying Marks = 70)

Status of the firm

Qualified / Suitable Not Qualified / Un-suitable Qualified / suitable Qualified / Suitable

DCP-I/HQ

WM/CSF/KWL

DD/P&L/HQ

XEN/CSF/HQ