

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

- 1 Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure as per rule 36(b)
- 3 Title of Procurement: Supply of M.S Round 9.4mm Dia Plain = 51 M.Ton for CSF/Kohat Cantt
- 4 Tender Inquiry No: CSF/1005/P/2023
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS518534E
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: 13.09.2023 at 11:00 Hours
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: 13.09.2023 at 11:30 Hours
- 8 No of Bids Received: One
- 9 Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

Name of Bidder	Technical Marks Obtained	Rule/Regulation/ SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004
M/s. Naimat Ullah Steel Works (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore.	95	The bid found responsive and technically qualified


(Muhammad Anjum)
for Managing Director/CSF,
Ph # 042-99201737.

S. No. 27

**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BID AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO.CSF/1005/P/2023 OPENED ON 13.09.2023 FOR THE
PROCUREMENT OF 51 M.TON M.S ROUND 9.4MM DIA PLAIN FOR CSF/KOHAT CANTT.**

PARTICULARS / REQUIREMENTS (AS PER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA, PLACED AT S.NO.3/134 to 3/136)		M/s Naimat Ullah Steel Works (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore. Provided or not provided		
(i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY)				
a	Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer/Sole proprietor/partnership deed/Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company OR registration of FBR as supplier etc?	Provided (As flagged-A in technical bid)		
b	Proof of registration with Sales Tax, Income Tax Departments and active on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List?	Provided (As flagged-B in technical bid)		
c	Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender?	Provided (As flagged-C in technical bid)		
d	Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed?	Provided (As flagged-D in technical bid)		
e	Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate, if the firm is already working in CSF?	Provided (As flagged-E in technical bid)		
f	Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (clause-18)?	CDR Provided (As flagged-F in technical bid)		
g	Has the bidder allowed that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities by signing on all pages of bidding documents?	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.		
h	Has the bidder certified on their letter head that goods shall be free of any defect, as per required standard material (steel) and material must be of specifications mentioned in criteria for evaluation (Table-1 & 2) on page No.129 of the bidding documents?	Provided (As flagged-G & G/1 in technical bid)		
i	Has the bidder provided proof / certificate on letter head or brochure / profile of the manufacturer showing that manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of M.S Round 9.4mm dia plain, at least 2 M.Ton per day?	Certificate Provided on letter head (As flagged-H in technical bid)		
All the Mandatory requirements fulfilled or not?		Yes fulfilled		
Particulars / Requirements		Total Marks	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained
(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING OF M.S ROUND/RAW MATERIAL (MAX: MARKS = 35)				
1	Has the bidder provided brochure or profile or letter or purchase orders showing that the bidder has experience of manufacturing / supplying M.S Round / Similar steel items to various organizations / customers / countries?	35	Copies of purchase orders of CSF Provided (As flagged-I in technical bid)	35 (More than 4 years experience)
	a) More than or equal to 4 years.	100%		
	b) Less than 4 years, but more than or equal to 3 years.	80%		
	c) Less than 3 years, but more than or equal to 2 years.	65%		
	d) Less than 2 years.	0%		

(iii) MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENTS & INSPECTION/ TESTING FACILITY (MAX: MARKS = 10)

1	Has the bidder provided list or information or brochure showing that the manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material?	5	List: Provided (As flagged-J in technical bid)	5
2	Has the bidder provided list or information or brochure showing that the manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities?	5	Not Provided	0

(iv) MANUFACTURING / SUPPLYING CAPACITY OF THE BIDDER (MAX: MARKS = 25)

1	Has the bidder provided brochure or profile or letter showing that the bidder has manufacturing / supplying capacity of desired / Similar steel items? Greater than or equal to 600 Ton per year. = 25 Marks. Less than 600, but more than or equal to 400 Ton per year = 20 Marks. Less than 400, but more than or equal to 200 Ton per year = 15 Marks. Less than 200, but more than or equal to 100 Ton per year = 05 Marks. Less than 50 Ton per year = 0 Marks.	25	Letter Provided (As flagged-H in technical bid)	25 (More than 600 Ton per year)
---	---	----	--	------------------------------------

(v) FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF THE BIDDER (MAX: MARKS = 30)

1	Has the bidder provided annual audit reports / bank statement or annual sales tax / income tax returns for the last 3 years showing the average annual turnover? Greater than or equal to 25 Million. = 30 Marks. Less than 25, but more than or equal to 20 Million = 25 Marks. Less than 20, but more than or equal to 15 Million = 20 Marks. Less than 15, but more than or equal to 10 Million = 15 Marks. Less than 10, but more than or equal to 5 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks.	30	Annual audit reports Provided (As flagged-K in technical bid)	30 (More than 25 million)
---	---	----	---	------------------------------

Total		100	-	95
Status of the firm		Technically Suitable / Qualified		

Dy; /CCP-I

Dy; CEN/South

Dy; CEN/Track

ANNEXURE-"A"

CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL

1. General

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

2. Weightage/Marks

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

- | | |
|--|----|
| i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory) | |
| ii. Experience of manufacturing / supplying of | 35 |
| Steel / raw material | |
| iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection | |
| / Testing Facility of the manufacturer | 10 |
| iv. Manufacturing Capacity | 25 |
| v. Financial Soundness | 30 |

Total 100 Marks

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% marks and fulfilling the basic / mandatory requirements to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

3. (i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory)

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company or Registration of FBR as supplier etc.
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List (documentary proof must be submitted along with bid).
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender.
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed.
- e) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate. If the firm has already working in CSF/Directorate.
- f) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (Clause-13).
- g) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission.

ANNEXURE-"A"**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

2. Weightage/Marks

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

- | | |
|--|-----------|
| i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory) | |
| ii. Experience of manufacturing / supplying of Steel / raw material | 35 |
| iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility of the manufacturer | 10 |
| iv. Manufacturing Capacity | 25 |
| v. Financial Soundness | <u>30</u> |

Total 100 Marks

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% marks and fulfilling the basic / mandatory requirements to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

3. (i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory)

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company or Registration of FBR as supplier etc.
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List (documentary proof must be submitted along with bid).
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender.
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed.
- e) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate. If the firm has already working in CSF/Directorate.
- f) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (Clause-18).
- g) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission.

5. (iii) Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility (Max Marks = 10)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material.	5
2	The manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities.	5

Note: The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure.

6. (iv) Manufacturing / supplying capacity of the bidder (Max Marks = 25)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Bidder has the manufacturing / supplying capacity of desired / similar steel items Greater than or equal to 600 Ton per year = 25 Marks. Less than 600, but more than or equal to 400 Ton per year = 20 Marks. Less than 400, but more than or equal to 200 Ton per year = 15 Marks. Less than 200, but more than or equal to 100 Ton per year = 10 Marks. Less than 100, but more than or equal to 50 Ton per year = 05 Marks. Less than 50 Ton per year = 0 Marks.	25

Note: Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter be enclosed for evidence.

7. (iv) Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 30)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years: Greater than or equal to 25 Million = 30 Marks Less than 25 Million, but more than or equal to 20 Million = 25 Marks Less than 20 Million, but more than or equal to 15 Million = 20 Marks Less than 15 Million, but more than or equal to 10 Million = 15 Marks. Less than 10 Million, but more than or equal to 5 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks	30

Note: - Annual Audit reports / Bank Statement or annual sales tax / income tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

Note	Similar item means M.S Round, HTS Wire, Wires etc;
------	--

Total = 100 Marks.
Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70

5. (iii) Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility (Max Marks = 10)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material.	5
2	The manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities.	5

Note: The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure.

6. (iv) Manufacturing / supplying capacity of the bidder (Max Marks = 25)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Bidder has the manufacturing / supplying capacity of desired / similar steel items Greater than or equal to 600 Ton per year = 25 Marks. Less than 600, but more than or equal to 400 Ton per year = 20 Marks. Less than 400, but more than or equal to 200 Ton per year = 15 Marks. Less than 200, but more than or equal to 100 Ton per year = 10 Marks. Less than 100, but more than or equal to 50 Ton per year = 05 Marks. Less than 50 Ton per year = 0 Marks.	25

Note: Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter be enclosed for evidence.

7. (iv) Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 30)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years: Greater than or equal to 25 Million = 30 Marks Less than 25 Million, but more than or equal to 20 Million = 25 Marks Less than 20 Million, but more than or equal to 15 Million = 20 Marks Less than 15 Million, but more than or equal to 10 Million = 15 Marks. Less than 10 Million, but more than or equal to 5 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks	30

Note: - Annual Audit reports / Bank Statement or annual sales tax / income tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

Note	Similar item means M.S Round, HTS Wire, Wires etc;
------	--

Total = 100 Marks.
Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70