

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

- 1 Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure (as per rule 36(b)
- 3 Title of Procurement: Supply of Tie Bars = 9,000 Nos for CSF/KHCT.
- 4 Tender Inquiry No: CSF/1010/P/2023
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: 26.05.2023 at 11:00 Hours
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: 26-05-2023 at 11:30 Hours
- 8 No of Bids Received: Three
- 9 Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

Name of Bidder	Technical Marks Obtained	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004
M/s. ASR Enterprises, Lahore.	70	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Continental Engineering Services, Karachi.	81	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s Naimat Ullah Steel Works (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore.	75	The bid found responsive and technically qualified


(Muhammad Anjum)
for Managing Director/CSF,
Ph # 042-99201737.

**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BIDS AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO.CSF/1010/P/2023 OPENED ON 26.5.2023 FOR
THE PROCUREMENT OF TIE BARS = 9,000 NOS FOR CSF/KHCT.**

PARTICULARS / REQUIREMENTS (AS PER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA, PLACED AT S.NO.7/125 & 7/127)		Total Marks	M/s ASR Enterprises, Lahore.		M/s. Continental Engg; (Pvt) Ltd; Karachi		M/s. Naimat Ullah Steel (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore	
			Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained
(i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY) (35 MARKS)								
a	Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc?	2	Provided (As flagged-1 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-9 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged- 20 in technical bid)	2
b	Proof of registration with Sales Tax, Income Tax Departments and active on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List?	2	Provided (As flagged-2 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-10 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged- 21 in technical bid)	2
c	Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender?	2	Provided (As flagged-3 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-11 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged- 22 in technical bid)	2
d	Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed?	2	Provided (As flagged-4 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-12 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged- 23 in technical bid)	2
e	Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore "OR" Registration of Carriage Factory/Islamabad	2	Provided (As flagged-5 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-13 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged- 24 in technical bid)	2
f	Has the bidder provided information / detail on declaration beneficial owners information form as attached Annexure-C' with bidding documents?	2	Provided (As flagged-6 in technical bid)	2	Provided on Stamp (As flagged-14 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged- 25 in technical bid)	2

g	Has the bidder provided documentary evidence that the manufacturer must have at least 2 years experience of manufacturing of similar goods (Tie Bars etc)?	2	Provided (As flagged-7 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-15 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-26 in technical bid)	2
h	Has the bidder allowed that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities by the signing on all pages of bidding documents?	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents	2
i	Has the bidder certified on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect, as per drawing and material must be of specifications (Table-1 & 2) mentioned on page No.127 of the bidding documents?	16	Provided	16	Provided (As flagged-16 in technical bid)	16	Provided (As flagged-27 in technical bid)	16
j	Has the bidder attached certificate on their letter head that the manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Tie Bars of Angle Iron, at least 200 Nos per day?	3	Provided (As flagged-31/A in technical bid)	3	Provided (As flagged-17 in technical bid)	3	Provided (As flagged-28 in technical bid)	3
Total (A):		35	-	35	-	35	-	35
(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING OF TIE BARS/RAW MATERIAL (25 MARKS)								
1	Has the bidder provided evidence in the shape of manufacturer's / company's brochure or profile or letter or copies of purchase orders showing that the Manufacturer has experience of supplying Tie Bars / Similar Goods to various organizations / customers / countries. Distribution of mark as per following detail: - a) More than 10 years. 100% b) Less than 10 years but more than 5 years. 80% c) Less than 5 years, more than 2 years. 65% d) Less than 2 years. 0%	25	Provided in the shape of Manufacturer's profile (As flagged-32 in technical bid)	25 (More than 10 years with CSF)	Provided in the shape of purchase order (As flagged-15 in technical bid)	16.25 (More than 2 years' experience)	Provided in the shape of purchase order (As flagged-26 in technical bid)	20 (More than 5 years with CSF)
(iii) MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENT & INSPECTION / TESTING FACILITY (20 MARKS)								
1	Has the bidder provided evidence in the form list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure showing that the manufacturer has all equipment's of their own required for manufacturing of offered material?	10	Provided	10	Provided in the shape of brochure (As flagged-18 in technical bid)	10	Provided (As flagged-29 in technical bid)	10

2	Has the bidder provided evidence in the form list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure showing that the manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities?	10	Not provided	0	Not Provided	0	Not provided	0
---	---	----	--------------	---	--------------	---	--------------	---

FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF BIDDER (20 MARKS)

1	Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years in the shape of annual audit reports / or annual sales tax returns of the bidder: Greater than 300 Million = 20 Marks 200 Million to 300 Million = 15 Marks 100 Million to 200 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 100 Million = 0 Marks	20	Provided in the shape of last 3 years bank statement (As flagged-8 in technical bid) 68.3 million	0	Provide in the shape of last 3 years audit reports (As flagged-19 in technical bid)	20 (Greater than 300 Million annual turnover)	Provided in the shape of annual audit reports (As flagged-30)	10 (Greater than 100 million)
---	--	----	---	---	--	--	--	----------------------------------

Total (B):		65	-	35	-	46.25	-	40
------------	--	----	---	----	---	-------	---	----

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70 (35 from mandatory & 35 from others) out of Total Marks = 100		Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 70		Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 81		Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 75	
---	--	---------------------------------------	--	---------------------------------------	--	---------------------------------------	--

Status of the firm		Technically Suitable / Qualified		Technically Suitable / Qualified		Technically Suitable / Qualified	
--------------------	--	----------------------------------	--	----------------------------------	--	----------------------------------	--

[Signature]
Dy; CCP-I/HQ
06/07/2023

[Signature]
Dy; CEN/South

[Signature]
05/07/23
Dy; CEN/Track

ANNEXURE-"A"**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

2. Weightage/Marks

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

- | | |
|---|-----------|
| i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory) | 35 |
| ii. Experience of manufacturing of
Steel/raw material | 25 |
| iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection
/ Testing Facility | 20 |
| iv. Financial Soundness | <u>20</u> |

Total 100 Marks

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% (35% from mandatory and 35% from others) marks to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

3. (i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory)

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc. **(2 Marks)**
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List **(documentary proof must be submitted along with bid)**. **(2 Marks)**
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender. **(2 Marks)**
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed. **(2 Marks)**
- e) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore "OR" Registration of Carriage Factory/Islamabad. **(2 Marks)**
- f) The bidder must provide the information / detail on declaration beneficial owners information form as attached **(Annexure-C)** **(2 Marks)**
- g) Manufacturer must have at least 2 years experience of manufacturing of similar goods (Tie Bars etc) **(documentary proof must be submitted alongwith bid)** **(2 Marks)**
- h) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of Bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission. **(2 Marks)**
- i) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect, as per drawing and material must be of following specifications (Table-1 & 2): - **(16 Marks)**

Contd.....

Bidder



ANNEXURE-"A/1"

TABLE-1 SPECIFICATION

LIMIT VALUES OF CHEMICAL COMPOSITION				Marks
RULING ELEMENTS		% BY WEIGHT		-
		Minimum	Maximum	-
Carbon	C	0.4	0.5	2
Manganese	Mn	0.75	1.20	2
Silicon	Si	-	0.40	2
Phosphorus	P	-	0.04	2
Sulphur	S	-	0.04	2

TABLE-2 DIMENSIONS AND PROPERTIES

		Minimum Value	Maximum Value	Marks
Tensile strength	Kg/mm ²	65.0 Kg/mm ²	90.0 Kg/mm ²	2
	"OR"	"OR"	"OR"	
	PSI	90,000 PSI	130,000 PSI	
Yield Value	Kg/mm ²	40 Kg/mm ²	-	2
	"OR"	"OR"	-	
	PSI	57,000 PSI	-	
Elongation at Rupture	%	13%	14%	2

- j) Manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Tie Bars of Angle Iron, at least 200 Nos per day (**Attach certificate on letterhead**) (3 Marks)

4. Experience of manufacturing of Tie Bars / Raw Material (Max Marks = 25)

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The Manufacturer has experience of supplying Tie Bars / Similar Goods to various organizations / customers / countries. a) More than 10 years. 100% b) Less than 10 years but more than 5 years. 80% c) Less than 5 years, more than 2 years. 65% d) Less than 2 years. 0%	25

Note: Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter / purchase orders be enclosed for evidence.

5. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility (Max Marks = 20)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material.	10
2	The manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities.	10

Note: The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure.

Contd.....

Bidder



ANNEXURE-"A/2"(i) **Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 20)**

S.No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years: Greater than 300 Million = 20 Marks 200 Million to 300 Million = 15 Marks 100 Million to 200 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 100 Million = 0 Marks	20

Note: - Annual Audit reports / Bank Statement or annual sales tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

**Total = 100 Marks. Minimum
Qualifying Marks = 70**