

# **TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT**

**(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)**

- 1 Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure (as per rule 36(b)
- 3 Title of Procurement: Supply of H.T.S Wire, 10mm dia (cold drawn from 16mm wire rod) = 490 M.Ton for CSF/Sukkur.
- 4 Tender Inquiry No: CSF/918/P/2022
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS504591E
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: 20-03-2023 at 12:00 Hours
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: 20-03-2023 at 12:30 Hours
- 8 No of Bids Received: Two
- 9 Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

<b>Name of Bidder</b>	<b>Technical Marks Obtained</b>	<b>Rule/Regulation/ SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004</b>
M/s. Al Majeed Ibrahim Steel Industries (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore.	89.5	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Spirit Industries (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore.	-	The bid found non-responsive and technically not qualified due to not fulfilling the basic eligibility / mandatory requirements of the tender

  
**(Tayyab Riaz)** 08/04/23

for Managing Director/CSF,  
Ph # 042-99201737.

ANNEXURE-"A"**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Personnel Capabilities, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

**2. Weightage/Marks**

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

i. Basic Eligibility	(Mandatory)	30
ii. Experience of manufacturing of		30
	Steel/raw material	
iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection		
	/ Testing Facility	20
iv. Financial Soundness		<u>20</u>

**Total 100 Marks**

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% marks to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

**3. Marks Distribution****(i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory) (30 Marks)**

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc. **(2 Marks)**
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List **(documentary proof must be submitted along with bid)**. **(2 Marks)**
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender. **(2 Marks)**
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed **(2 Marks)**
- e) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents in the shape of Deposit at Call Receipt from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore. **(2 Marks)**
- f) In case of material to be imported, the bidder is to provide original proforma invoice of their principal abroad without showing the rates alongwith their technical bid. For bidders who are direct importer of the intended goods (HTS Wire 10mm dia from 16mm wire rod), they need to provide the original proforma invoice of their principal abroad showing rates alongwith their financial bid. **(2 Marks)**
- g) Manufacturer must have at least 2 year's experience of manufacturing of similar goods (HTS Wire, High Carbon Steel, High Carbon Wire Rod etc). Manufacturer's letter / email or company brochure to be enclosed. **(2 Marks)**
- h) The relevant parameters /specifications and terms of delivery of the tendered material should be confirmed. Bidders shall sign all pages of Tender Conditions/Specification in token of acceptance/conformity. **(2 Marks)**

Bidder

Purchaser

**ANNEXURE-"A/1"**

- i) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities (If within Pakistan). The signatures of Bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission. **(2 Marks)**
- j) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect and as per specifications & drawing according to required standard material (steel) and scope of manufacturing of HTS Wire (i.e. must be Cold Drawn from 16mm wire rod to 10mm dia) as mentioned on page No.64 to 69 of the bidding documents. **(Attach certificate on letterhead). (7 Marks)**
- k) Manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity at least 5 M.Ton per day **(Attach certificate on letterhead) (5 Marks)**

**Note:** Any major deviation would render the bid likely to be rejected. Bidder must keep in mind while submitting their bid to avoid major deviations which may include:-

- i) Bid Security being not enclosed with Technical Bid.
- ii) Conditional bid being offered e.g. to stipulate condition of advance payment or other conditions.
- iii) Specifications have not been signed / confirmed.
- iv) Delivery Period has not been accepted/confirmed.

**(ii) Experience of manufacturing of H.T. Steel / raw material (Max Marks = 30)**

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	
1	The Manufacturer has experience of supplying tendered (similar) goods to various organizations / customers / countries.	30	
	a) More than 10 years.		100%
	b) Less than 10 years but more than 5 years.		80%
	c) Less than 5 years, more than 2 years.		65%
	d) Less than 2 years.		0%

**Note:** Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter may be enclosed for evidence. The information would meant for the purpose of evaluation only. Successful bidder shall have option of procurement of material from any other manufacturer meeting the evaluation criteria

**(iii) Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility (Max Marks = 20)**

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The original / local manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered/similar Goods or he is a bonafide/authorized dealer of OEM.	10
2	The steel manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities.	10

**Note:** The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure. The information would meant for the purpose of evaluation only. Successful bidder shall have option of procurement of material from any other manufacturer meeting the evaluation criteria.

**Bidder**

**Purchaser**

ANNEXURE-"A/2"**(iv) Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 20)**

S.No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	<b>Annual Turnover of Bidder</b> Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years:  Greater than 300 Million = 20 Marks 200 Million to 300 Million = 15 Marks 100 Million to 200 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 100 Million = 0 Marks	20

**Note:** - Annual Audit reports or annual sales tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

**Total = 100 Marks.**

**Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70**

**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BIDS AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO.CSF/918/P/2022 OPENED ON 20.03.2023**  
**FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF H.T.S WIRE = 490 M.TON FOR CSF/SUKKUR.**

50003

PARTICULARS / REQUIREMENTS (AS PER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA)	Total Marks	M/s Spirit Industries (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore.		M/s. Al Majeed Ibrahim Steel Industries (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore	
		Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained
<b>(i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY) (30 MARKS)</b>					
a Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc?	2	Provided (As flagged-1 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As flagged-13 in technical bid)	2
b Proof of registration with Sales Tax, Income Tax Departments and active on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List?	2	Provided (As flagged-2 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As flagged-14 in technical bid)	2
c Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender?	2	Provided (As flagged-3 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As flagged-15 in technical bid)	2
d Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed?	2	Provided (As flagged-4 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As flagged-16 in technical bid)	2
e Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents in favor of FA&CAO, M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore OR registration of the firm with CF/I?	2	Provided (As flagged-5 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As flagged-17 in technical bid)	2
f In case of material to be imported, the bidder is to provide original proforma invoice of their principal abroad without showing the rates alongwith their technical bid. For bidders who are direct importer of the intended goods (HTS Wire 10mm dia from 16mm wire rod), they need to provide the original proforma invoice of their principal abroad showing rates alongwith their financial bid?	2	Provided (As flagged-6 in technical bid)	-	Provided in the shape of contract (As flagged-18 in technical bid)	2
g Manufacturer must have at least 2 years' experience of manufacturing of similar goods (HTS Wire, High Carbon Steel, High Carbon Wire Rod etc). Manufacturer's letter / email or company brochure to be enclosed?	2	Provided (As flagged-9 in technical bid)	-	Provided in the shape of brochure of manufacturer of wire rod as flagged-18 and bidder has already supplied HTS Wire to CSF against many purchase orders for more than 4 years (As per record of CSF).	2

*Handwritten signature and stamp*

*Handwritten signature and stamp*

h	The relevant parameters /specifications and terms of delivery of the tendered material should be confirmed. Bidders shall sign all pages of Tender Conditions/Specification in token of acceptance/conformity?	2	Yes by signing all pages of tender conditions / specifications.	-	Yes by signing all pages of tender conditions / specifications.	2
i	The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities (If within Pakistan). The signatures of Bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission?	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	-	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	2
j	Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect and as per specifications & drawing according to required standard material (Steel and scope of manufacturing of HTS Wire (i.e must be Cold Drawn from 16mm Wire rod to 10mm dia) as mentioned on page No.64 to 69 of the bidding documents.	7	Provided (As flagged-8 & 8(a) in technical bid)	-	Provided (As flagged-19 in technical bid)	7
K	Manufacture must have manufacturing capacity at least 5 M.Ton per day?	5	Not Provided	-	Provided (As flagged-20 in technical bid)	5
<b>(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING OF H.T Steel/RAW MATERIAL (30 MARKS)</b>						
1	The Manufacturer has experience of supplying tendered (similar) goods to various organizations / customers / countries. a) More than 10 years. 100% b) Less than 10 years but more than 5 years. 80% c) Less than 5 years, more than 2 years. 65% d) Less than 2 years. 0%	30	Provided in the shape of brochure of manufacturer (As flagged-9 in technical bid)	-	Provided in the shape of brochure of manufacturer of wire rod as flagged-18 and bidder has already supplied HTS Wire to CSF against many purchase orders for more than 4 years (as per record of CSF).	19.5
<b>(iii) MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENT &amp; INSPECTION/TESTING FACILITY (20 MARKS)</b>						
1	The original / local manufacturer has all equipment's of their own required for manufacturing of offered/similar Goods in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in company brochure "OR" he is a bonafide/authorized dealer of OEM?	10	Provided (As flagged-10 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As flagged-21 in technical bid)	10
2	The steel manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities?	10	Provided in the shape of brochure (As flagged-11 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As flagged-21 in technical bid)	10

*Handwritten signature*  
10/11/2017

*Handwritten signature*  
10/11/2017

**FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF BIDDER (20 MARKS)**

<p>1 Annual Turnover of Bidder in the shape of Annual Audit Reports or Sales Tax Return for last 3 years Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years:</p> <p>Greater than 300 Million = 20 Marks 200 Million to 300 Million = 15 Marks 100 Million to 200 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 100 Million = 0 Marks</p>	20	Provided in the shape of annual audit report (At Flagged-12 in technical Bid)	-	Provided in the shape of annual audit report (At Flagged-22 in technical Bid)	20 (Greater than 40 Million Average annual turn Over)
Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70 out of Total Marks = 100		-		Total Marks Obtained = 89.5	
Status of the firm		Technically Un-Suitable / Not Qualified due to not fulfilling the mandatory requirements	Technically Suitable / Qualified and fulfilling all the mandatory requirements		

*[Signature]*  
08/4/2023  
**Dy; CCP-I/HQ**

*[Signature]*  
6/4/23  
**Dy; CEN/S&C**

*[Signature]*  
6/4/23  
**Dy; CEN/Track**