


# **TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT**

**(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)**

- 1 Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure (as per rule 36(b))
- 3 Title of Procurement: Supply of Bell Washers = 230,000 Nos for CSF/Khanewal.
- 4 Tender Inquiry No: CSF/925/P/2022
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS504591E
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: 20-03-2023 at 12:00 Hours
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: 20-03-2023 at 12:30 Hours
- 8 No of Bids Received: Three
- 9 Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

<b>Name of Bidder</b>	<b>Technical Marks Obtained</b>	<b>Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004</b>
M/s. Continental Engg: Services (Pvt) Ltd; Karachi.	96	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Decent Builders, Lahore.	80	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Spirit Industries (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore.	-	The bid found non-responsive and technically not qualified due to not fulfilling the basic eligibility / mandatory requirements of the tender

  
**(Tayyab Riaz)**

for Managing Director/CSF,  
Ph # 042-99201737.

ANNEXURE-"A"**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Personnel Capabilities, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

**2. Weightage/Marks**

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory)	40
ii. Experience of manufacturing of Steel/raw material	30
iii. Manufacturing equipments facility	10
iv. Financial Soundness	<u>20</u>
<b>Total 100 Marks</b>	

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% marks to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

**3. Marks Distribution****(i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory) (40 Marks)**

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc. **(3 Marks)**
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List **(documentary proof must be submitted along with bid)**. **(3 Marks)**
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender. **(2 Marks)**
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed **(2 Marks)**
- e) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents in the shape mentioned in BDS from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore. **(2 Marks)**
- f) Manufacturer must have at least 2 years' experience of manufacturing of similar goods (Bell Washers etc). **(documentary proof must be submitted along with bid)**. **(2 Marks)**
- g) The relevant parameters /specifications and terms of delivery of the tendered material should be confirmed. Bidders shall sign all pages of Tender Conditions/Specification in token of acceptance/conformity. **(2 Marks)**
- h) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of Bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission. **(2 Marks)**
- i) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect and as per specifications & drawing according to required standard material (steel) mentioned on page No.63 to 70 of the bidding documents. **(Attach certificate on letterhead)**. **(12 Marks)**
- j) Manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity at least 5000 Nos Bell Washers per day **(Attach certificate on letterhead)** **(10 Marks)**

Bidder



**ANNEXURE-"A/1"**

**Note:** Any major deviation would render the bid likely to be rejected. Bidder must keep in mind while submitting their bid to avoid major deviations which may include:-

- i) Bid Security being not enclosed with Technical Bid.
- ii) Conditional bid being offered e.g. to stipulate condition of advance payment or other conditions.
- iii) Specifications have not been signed/confirmed.
- iv) Delivery Period has not been accepted/confirmed.

**(ii) Experience of manufacturing of Bell Washers / raw material (Max Marks = 30)**

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The Manufacturer has experience of supplying tendered (similar) goods to various organizations / customers / countries.	30
	a) More than 5 years. 100%	
	b) Less than 4 years but more than 3 years. 80%	
	c) Less than 3 years, more than 2 years. 65%	
	d) Less than 2 years. 0%	

**Note:** Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter may be enclosed for evidence.

**(iii) Manufacturing equipments facility (Max Marks = 10)**

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered/similar Goods.	10

**Note:** The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list or contained in the company brochure.

**(iv) Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 20)**

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	<b>Annual Turnover of Bidder</b> Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years:  Greater than 40 Million = 20 Marks 30 Million to 40 Million = 18 Marks 20 Million to 30 Million = 15 Marks. 10 Million to 20 Million = 12 Marks. 5 Million to 10 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 100 Million = 0 Marks	20

**Note:** - Annual Audit reports or annual sales tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

**Total = 100 Marks.**

**Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70**

**Bidder**



**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BIDS AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO. CSF/925/P/2022 OPENED ON 20.03.2023 FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF 230,000 NOS BELL WASHERS FOR CSF/KHANEWAL.**

(i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY) (40 MARKS)	PARTICULARS / REQUIREMENTS (AS PER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA MENTIONED IN BIDDING DOCUMENTS)	Total Marks	M/s. Spirit Industries (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore.		M/s. Continental Engineering Services (Pvt) Ltd; Karachi		M/s Decent Builders, Lahore	
			Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained		Provided or not provided
a	Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc?	3	Provided (As Flagged-1 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As Flagged-10 in technical bid)	3	Provided registration of PEC (As Flagged-20 in technical bid)	3
b	Proof of registration with Sales Tax, Income Tax Departments and active on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List?	3	Provided (As Flagged-2 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As Flagged-11 in technical bid)	3	Provided (As Flagged-21 in technical bid)	3
c	Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender?	2	Provided (As Flagged-3 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As Flagged-12 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As Flagged-22 in technical bid)	2
d	Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed?	2	Provided (As Flagged-4 in technical bid)	-	Provided (As Flagged-13 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As Flagged-22 in technical bid)	2
e	Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents in favor of FA&CAO, M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore OR registration of the firm with CF/I?	2	Provided registration (As Flagged-5 in technical bid)	-	Provided in the shape of Bank Guarantee (As Flagged-14 in technical bid)	2	Provided In the shape of CDR (As Flagged-23 in technical bid)	2
f	Manufacturer's desired information / documentary evidence of experience of at least 2 years for manufacturing of similar goods (Bell Washers etc)?	2	Provided copies of contract agreements with Pakistan Railway (As Flagged-6 in technical bid)	-	Provided copies of contract agreements with CSF & other (Pvt) Units (As Flagged-15 in technical bid)	2	Provided in the shape of certificate & purchase orders for supply of bell washers to CSF (As Flagged-24 in technical bid)	2
g	Has the bidder confirmed / accepted the relevant parameters / specifications and terms of delivery of the tendered material by signing all pages of tender conditions / specifications?	2	Yes by signing all pages of tender conditions / specifications.	-	Yes by signing all pages of tender conditions / specifications	2	Yes by signing all pages of tender conditions / specifications	2
h	Has the bidder allowed that the purchaser shall have right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities, by signing all pages of bidding documents?	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	-	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	2

DD/12/22, HR

KE/1/25

	Firm's certificate on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect and as per specifications & drawing according to required standard material (steel) mentioned on page No.63 to 70 of the bidding documents?	12	Certificate Provided (As flagged-7 & 7 (a) in technical bid)	-	Certificate Provided (As flagged-16 in technical bid)	12	Certificate Provided (As flagged-25 in technical bid)	12	
	Firm's certificate on their letter head that the manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity at least 5000 Nos Bell Washers per day?	10	Not provided	-	Provided (As flagged-17 in technical bid)	10	Provided (As flagged-26 in technical bid)	10	
<b>(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING OF BELL WASHERS/RAW MATERIAL (30 MARKS)</b>									
1	Experience of manufacturer for supplying of similar goods to various organizations / customers / countries, in the shape of brochure / profile / letter? <b>Marks Distribution according to experience</b>	30	Provided copies of contract agreements with Pakistan Railway (As flagged-6 in technical bid)	-	Provided copies of contract agreements with CSF & other (Pvt) Units (As flagged-15 in technical bid)	24 (Less than 04 Years)	Provided in the shape of certificate & purchase orders for supply of bell washers to CSF (As flagged-24 in technical bid)	30 (More than 5 years)	
	a) More than 5 years							100% Marks	
	b) Less than 4 years but more than 3 years							80% Marks	
	c) Less than 3 years, more than 2 years							65% Marks	
	d) Less than 2 years							0% Marks	
<b>(iii) MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENTS FACILITY (10 MARKS)</b>									
1	The manufacturer has all equipment's of their own required for manufacturing of offered/ similar Goods?	10	List Provided (As flagged-8 & 8(a) in technical bid)	-	List Provided (As flagged-18 in technical bid)	10	List Provided (As flagged-28 in technical bid)	10	
<b>(iv) FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF BIDDER (20 MARKS)</b>									
1	Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years: Greater than 40 Million = 20 Marks 30 Million to 40 Million = 18 Marks 20 Million to 30 Million = 15 Marks. 10 Million to 20 Million = 12 Marks. 5 Million to 10 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks	20	Provided in the shape of annual audit report (At S.No.9)	-	Annual Turnover Provided in the shape of financial/ audit reports (As flagged-19 in technical bid)	20 (Greater than 40 Million annual turn Over)	Provided	0 (Less than 5 Million average annual turn Over)	
<b>Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70 out of Total Marks = 100</b>			-		<b>Total Marks Obtained = 96</b>		<b>Total Marks Obtained = 80</b>		
<b>Status of the firm</b>			Technically Un-suitable / Not Qualified due to not fulfilling the basic eligibility / mandatory requirements of evaluation criteria against clause (j) f above		Technically Suitable / Qualified (Fulfilling all the mandatory requirements)		Technically Suitable / Qualified (Fulfilling all the mandatory requirements)		

DD/ P&L/HQ/LHR

XEN/CSF